



J.K. SHAH[®]
TEST SERIES
Evaluate Learn Succeed

SUGGESTED SOLUTION

INTERMEDIATE M'19 EXAM

SUBJECT- LAW

Test Code – PIN 5049 M

BRANCH - () (Date :)

Head Office : Shraddha, 3rd Floor, Near Chinai College, Andheri (E), Mumbai – 69.

Tel : (022) 26836666

ANSWER-1**(30*1 = 30 MARKS)**

1. D
2. A
3. A
4. D
5. D
6. D
7. B
8. D
9. A
10. C
11. A
12. A
13. B
14. A
15. D
16. C
17. D
18. D
19. D
20. A
21. B
22. D
23. A
24. B
25. A
26. D
27. D
28. D
29. A
30. A

ANSWER-2**ANSWER-A**

Small Company: According to Section 2(85) of the Companies Act, 2013, Small Company means a company, other than a public company,—

- (1) **paid-up share capital of which does not exceed fifty lakh rupees or such higher amount as may be prescribed which shall not be more than five crore rupees; and**
- (2) **turnover of which as per its last profit and loss account does not exceed two crore rupees or such higher amount as may be prescribed which shall not be more than twenty crore rupees.**

Nothing in this clause shall apply to—

- (A) a holding company or a subsidiary company;
 - (B) a company registered under section 8; or
 - (C) a company or body corporate governed by any special Act.
- (i) In the present case, MNP Private Ltd., a company registered under the Companies Act, 2013 with a paid up share capital of Rs. 45 lakh and having turnover of Rs. 3 crore. Since only one criteria of share capital of Rs. 50 Lakhs is met, but the second criteria of turnover of Rs. 2 crores is not met and the provisions require both the criteria to be met in order to avail the status of a small company, MNP Ltd. cannot avail the status of small company.
- (ii) If the turnover of the company is Rs. 1.50 crore, then both the criteria will be fulfilled and MNP Ltd. can avail the status of small company.

(6 MARKS)

ANSWER-B

According to Section 3(26) of the General Clauses Act, 1897, 'Immovable Property' shall include:

- (i) Land,
- (ii) Benefits to arise out of land, and
- (iii) Things attached to the earth, or permanently fastened to anything attached to the earth.

For example, trees are immovable property because trees are benefits arise out of the land and attached to the earth. However, timber is not immovable property as the same are not permanently attached to the earth. In the same manner, buildings are immovable property.

(4 MARKS)

ANSWER-3

ANSWER-A

A company may, subject to the passing of a resolution in general meeting and subject to such rules as may be prescribed in consultation with the Reserve Bank of India, accept deposits from its members on such terms and conditions, including the provision of security, if any, or for the repayment of such deposits with interest, as may be agreed upon between the company and its members, subject to the fulfillment of the following conditions, namely—

- (a) issuance of a circular to its members including therein a statement showing the financial position of the company, the credit rating obtained, the total number of depositors and the amount due towards deposits in respect of any previous deposits accepted by the company and such other particulars in such form and in such manner as may be prescribed;
- (b) filing a copy of the circular along with such statement with the Registrar within 30 days before the date of issue of the circular;
- (c) depositing such sum which shall not be less than fifteen per cent. of the amount of its deposits maturing during a financial year and the financial year next following, and kept in a scheduled bank in a separate bank account to be called as deposit repayment reserve account;

- (d) providing such deposit insurance in such manner and to such extent as may be prescribed;
- (e) certifying that the company has not committed any default in the repayment of deposits accepted either before or after the commencement of this Act or payment of interest on such deposits; and
- (f) providing security, if any for the due repayment of the amount of deposit or the interest thereon including the creation of such charge on the property or assets of the company :

Where a company does not secure the deposits or secures such deposits partially, then, the deposits shall be termed as “unsecured deposits” and shall be so quoted in every circular, form, advertisement or in any document related to invitation or acceptance of deposits.¹

Exception : In case of private company - Points (a) to (e) above shall not apply to private Companies which accepts from its members monies not exceeding 100%, of aggregate of the paid up share capital and free reserves, and such company shall file the details of monies so accepted to the Registrar in such manner as may be specified.

- (1) **Repayment of deposit** : Every deposit accepted by a company shall be repaid with interest in accordance with the terms and conditions of the agreement.
- (2) **Failure on the repayment of deposit** : Where a company fails to repay the deposit or part thereof or any interest thereon, the depositor concerned may apply to the Tribunal for an order directing the company to pay the sum due or for any loss or damage incurred by him as a result of such non-payment and for such other orders as the Tribunal may deem fit.

Application of the amount of deposit repayment reserve account : The deposit repayment reserve account shall not be used by the company for any purpose other than repayment of deposits.

(6 MARKS)

ANSWER-B

Section 40 (6) of the Companies Act 2013, provides that a company may pay commission to any person in connection with the subscription or procurement of subscription to its securities, whether absolute or conditional, subject to the a number of conditions which are prescribed under *Companies (Prospectus and Allotment of Securities) Rules, 2014*. In relation to the case given, the conditions applicable under the above Rules are as under:

- (a) **The payment of such commission shall be authorized in the company’s articles of association;**
- (b) **The commission may be paid out of proceeds of the issue or the profit of the company or both;**
- (c) **The rate of commission paid or agreed to be paid shall not exceed, in case of shares, five percent (5%) of the price at which the shares are issued or a rate authorised by the articles, whichever is less, and in case of debentures, shall not exceed two and a half per cent (2.5 %) of the price at which the debentures are issued, or as specified in the company’s articles, whichever is less;**

Thus, the Underwriting commission is limited to 5% of issue price in case of shares and 2.5% in case of debentures. The rates of commission given above are maximum rates. In view of the above, the decision of Unique Builders Ltd. to pay underwriting commission exceeding 2% as prescribed in the Articles is invalid.

The company may pay the underwriting commission in the form of flats as both the Companies Act and the Rules do not impose any restriction on the mode of payment though the source has been restricted to either the proceeds of the issue or profits of the company.

(6 MARKS)

ANSWER-C

Change in the name of company : In the first instance, Mars Textile India Ltd., should ascertain from the Registrar of Companies whether the proposed name viz. National Textiles and Industries Ltd. is available or not. For this purpose, the company should file the prescribed Form No.INC.24 with the Registrar along with the necessary fees. The Registrar after examination will inform whether the new name is available or not for registration.

In case the name is available, the company has to pass a special resolution approving the change of name to National Textiles and Industries Ltd.

Thereafter the approval of the Central Government should be obtained as provided in Section 13(2) of the Companies Act, 2013. The power of Central Government in this regard has been delegated to the Registrar of Companies. Thus, the company has to file an application along with the prescribed filing fee for change of name. The change of name shall be complete and effective only on the issue of a fresh certificate of incorporation by the Registrar. The Registrar shall enter the new name in the Register in place of the former name 13(3). The change of name shall not affect any rights or obligations of the company and it shall not render defective any legal proceedings by or against it.

(4*1 = 4 MARKS)

ANSWER-D

- (a) **Proviso :** The normal function of a proviso is to except something out of the enactment or to qualify something stated in the enactment which would be within its purview if the proviso were not there. The effect of the proviso is to qualify the preceding enactment which is expressed in terms which are too general. As a general rule, a **proviso is added to an enactment to qualify or create an exception to what is in the enactment.** Ordinarily a proviso is not interpreted as stating a general rule.

It is a cardinal rule of interpretation that a proviso to a particular provision of a statute only embraces the field which is covered by the main provision. It carves out an **exception to the main provision to which it has been enacted as a proviso and to no other.** (*Ram Narain Sons Ltd. vs. Assistant Commissioner of Sales Tax, AIR 1955 SC 765*).

(2 MARKS)

- (b) **Explanation:** An Explanation is at times appended to a section to explain the meaning of the text of the section. An Explanation may be added to include something within the section or to exclude something from it. An Explanation should normally be so read as to harmonise with and clear up any ambiguity in the main section. It should not be so construed as to widen the ambit of the section.

However, it would be wrong to always construe an explanation limited to the aforesaid objects. The meaning to be given to an explanation will really depend upon its terms and not on any theory of its purpose.

(2 MARKS)

ANSWER-4

ANSWER-A

Verification of instrument evidencing creation or modification of Charge : A copy of every instrument evidencing any creation or modification of charge and required to be filed with the Registrar in pursuance of section 77, 78 or 79 shall be verified as follows-

- (a) where the instrument or deed relates solely to the property situated outside India, the copy shall be verified by a certificate issued either under the seal, if any, of the company, or under the hand of any director or company secretary of the company or an authorised officer of the charge holder or under the hand of some person other than the company who is interested in the mortgage or charge;
- (b) where the instrument or deed relates, whether wholly or partly, to the property situated in India, the copy shall be verified by a certificate issued under the hand of any director or company secretary of the company or an authorised officer of the charge holder.

(4 MARKS)

ANSWER-B

According to **Section 46(1) of the Companies Act, 2013, a share certificate once issued under the common seal, if any, of the company or signed by two directors or by a director and the Company Secretary, wherever the company has appointed a Company Secretary, specifying the shares held by any person, shall be prima facie evidence of the title of the person to such shares.** Therefore, in the normal course the person named in the share certificate is for all practical purposes the legal owner of the shares therein and the company cannot deny his title to the shares.

However, a **forged transfer is a nullity.** It does not give the transferee (Y) any title to the shares. Similarly any transfer made by Y (to Z) will also not give a good title to the shares as the title of the buyer is only as good as that of the seller.

Therefore, if the company acts on a forged transfer and removes the name of the real owner (X) from the Register of Members, then the company is bound to restore the name of X as the holder of the shares and to pay him any dividends which he ought to have received .

In the above case, 'therefore, X has the right against the company to get the shares recorded in his name. However, neither Y nor Z' have any rights against the company even though they are bona fide purchasers.

However, since X seems to be the perpetrator of the forgery, he will be liable both criminally and for compensation to Y and Z.

(4 MARKS)

ANSWER-C

Where the language used in a statute is capable of more than one interpretation, the most firmly established rule for construction is the principle laid down in the Heydon's case. This rule enables, consideration of four matters in constituting an act :

- (1) what was the law before making of the Act,
- (2) what was the mischief or defect for which the law did not provide,
- (3) what is the remedy that the Act has provided, and
- (4) what is the reason for the remedy.

The rule then directs that the courts must adopt that construction which 'shall suppress the mischief and advance the remedy'. Therefore even in a case where the usual meaning of the language used falls short of the whole object of the legislature, a more extended meaning may be attributed to the words, provided they are fairly susceptible of it. If the object of any enactment is public safety, then its working must be interpreted widely to give effect to that object. Thus in the case of Workmen's Compensation Act, 1923 the main object being provision of compensation to workmen, it was held that the Act ought to be so construed, as far as possible, so as to give effect to its primary provisions.

However, it has been emphasized by the Supreme Court that the rule in Heydon's case is applicable only when the words used are ambiguous and are reasonably capable of more than one meaning [*CIT v. Sodra Devi (1957) 32 ITR 615 (SC)*]. **(6 MARKS)**

ANSWER-D

Every company is required to file with the Registrar of Companies, the annual return as prescribed in section 92, in Form MGT – 7 as per Rule 11(1) of the Companies (Management & Administration) Rules, 2014.

The particulars contained in an annual return, to be filed by every company are as follows–

1. Its registered office, principal business activities, particulars of its holding, subsidiary and associate companies;
2. Its shares, debentures and other securities and shareholding pattern
3. Its indebtedness;
4. Its members and debenture-holders along with the changes therein since the close of the previous financial year;
5. Its promoters, directors, key managerial personnel along with changes therein since the close of the previous financial year;
6. Meetings of members or a class thereof, Board and its various committees along with attendance details;
7. Remuneration of directors and key managerial personnel;
8. Penalty or punishment imposed on the company, its directors or officers and details of compounding of offences and appeals made against such penalty or punishment;
9. Matters relating to certification of compliances, disclosures;
10. Details in respect of shares held by or on behalf of the Foreign Institutional Investors including their names, addresses, countries of incorporation, registration and percentage of shareholding held by them;
11. Such other matters as may be prescribed. **(6 MARKS)**

ANSWER-5

ANSWER-A

- (i) Section 127 of the Companies Act, 2013 provides for punishment for failure to distribute dividend on time. One of such situations is where a shareholder has given directions to the company regarding the payment of the dividend and those directions cannot be complied with and the same has not been communicated to her.

In the given situation, the company has failed to communicate to the shareholder Mrs. Sheela about non-compliance of her direction regarding payment of dividend. Hence, the penal provisions under section 127 will be applicable. **(2 MARKS)**

- (ii) Section 127, inter-alia, provides that no offence shall be deemed to have been committed where the dividend could not be paid by reason of operation of law.

In the present circumstance, the dividend could not be paid because it was not allowed to be paid by the court until the matter was resolved about succession. Hence, there will not be any liability on the company and its Directors etc. **(2 MARKS)**

ANSWER-B

Financial Statement is defined under Section 2 (40), to include–

- (i) Balance sheet
- (ii) Profit and loss account or income and expenditure account
- (iii) Cash flow statement
- (iv) Statement of change in equity, if applicable
- (v) any explanatory notes annexed to or forming part of financial statements

However, the financial statement with respect to one Person Company, small company and dormant company, may not include the cash flow statement.

(4 MARKS)

ANSWER-C

In accordance with the provisions of the Companies Act, 2013, as contained under section 134 (1), the financial statements, including consolidated financial statement, if any, shall be approved by the Board of Directors before they are signed on behalf of the Board by at least :

- (1) The Chairperson of the company where he is authorized by the Board; or
- (2) Two directors out of which one shall be the managing director and
- (3) The other Chief Executive Officer, if he is a director in the company
- (4) The Chief Financial Officer and the Company Secretary of the company, wherever they are appointed.

In case of a One Person Company, the financial statements shall be signed by only one director, for submission to the auditor for his report thereon.

The Board's report and annexures thereto shall be signed by its Chairperson of the company, if he is authorized by the Board and where he is not so authorized, shall be signed by at least two directors one of whom shall be a managing director or by the director where there is one director. **(4 MARKS)**

- (i) In the given case, the Balance Sheet and Profit & Loss Account have been signed by Mr. X and Mr. Y, the directors. In view of the provisions of Section 134 (1), the Managing Director Mr. D should be one of the two signatories. Since the company has also employed a full time Secretary, he should also sign the Balance Sheet and Profit & Loss Account. Therefore, authentication done by two directors is not valid. **(1 MARK)**
- (ii) In case of OPC, the financial statements should be signed by one director and hence, the authentication is in order.

ANSWER-D

Registration of charges :

Under section 77 (1) of the Companies Act, 2013 it shall be the duty of every company creating a charge :

- a. within or outside India,
- b. on its property or assets or any of its undertakings,
- c. whether tangible or otherwise, and
- d. situated in or outside India,

to register the particulars of the charge signed by the company and the charge-holder together with the instruments, if any, creating such charge in such form, on payment of such fees and in such manner as may be prescribed, with the Registrar within thirty days of its creation

Provided that the Registrar may, on an application made by the company, allow such registration to be made within a period of three hundred days of such creation on payment of such additional fees as may be prescribed.

Provided further that if registration is not made within a period of three hundred days of such creation, the company shall seek extension of time in accordance with section 87 which empowers the Central Government to grant extension of time for filing of charges on an application made to it and under specified circumstances.

Provided also that any subsequent registration of a charge shall not prejudice any right acquired in respect of any property before the charge is actually registered.

Section 77 (2) provides that where a charge is registered with the Registrar under sub-section (1) (as explained above), he shall issue a certificate of registration of such charge in such form and in such manner as may be prescribed to the company and, as the case may be, to the person in whose favour the charge is created.

Section 77 (4) further provides that nothing shall prejudice any contract or obligation for the repayment of the money secured by a charge. This means that the obligation of a company to repay the debt is not affected by the non registration of the charge.

Section 78 further provides that if the company fails to register the charge, the same can be done by the person in whose favour the charge is created by following the prescribed conditions.

(6 MARKS)

ANSWER-6

ANSWER-A

- (i) **Section 139(6) of the Companies Act, 2013 lays down that the first auditor of a company shall be appointed by the Board of Directors within 30 days of the registration of the company.**

Section 139 (6) continues to provide further that if the Board of Directors fails to appoint such auditor, it shall inform the members of the company, who shall within ninety days at an extraordinary general meeting appoint such auditor and such auditor shall hold office till the conclusion of the first annual general meeting.

From the above provisions of law if the Board of Directors fails to appoint the first auditors within the stipulated 30 days, it shall take the following steps:

- a. **Inform the members** of the Company;
- b. Immediately take steps to **convene an extra ordinary general meeting** not later than 90 days;
- c. Members shall at that extra ordinary meeting **appoint the first auditors** of the company;
- d. The first auditors so appointed shall hold office upto the conclusion of the first AGM of the company.

- (ii) Section 140 of the Companies Act, 2013 prescribes certain procedure for removal of auditors. Under section 140 (1) the auditor appointed under section 139 may be removed from his office before the expiry of his term only by a special resolution of the company, after obtaining the previous approval of the Central Government in that behalf in the prescribed manner. From this sub section it is clear that the approval of the Central Government shall be taken first and thereafter the special resolution of the company should be passed.

Provided that before taking any action under this sub-section, the auditor concerned shall be given a reasonable opportunity of being heard.

Therefore, in terms of section 140 (1) of the Companies Act, 2013 read with rule 7 of the *Companies (Audit & Auditors) Rules, 2014* the following steps should be taken for the removal of an auditor before the completion of his term :

The application to the Central Government for removal of auditor shall made in Form ADT-2 and shall be accompanied with fees as provided for this purpose under the Companies (Registration Offices and Fees) Rules, 2014

- a. The application shall be made to the Central Government within thirty days of the resolution passed by the Board.
- b. The company shall hold the general meeting within sixty days of receipt of approval of the Central Government for passing the special resolution.

(7 MARKS)

ANSWER-B

Under the *Companies (Prospectus and Allotment of Securities) Rules, 2014* the rate of commission paid or agreed to be paid shall not exceed, in case of shares, five percent (5%) of the price at which the shares are issued or a rate authorised by the articles, whichever is less.

In the given problem, the articles of X Ltd. have prescribed 4% underwriting commission but the directors decided to pay 5% underwriting commission.

Therefore, the decision of the Board of Directors to pay 5% commission to the underwriters is invalid.

(3 MARKS)

ANSWER-C

Basis for Doctrine of Indoor Management:

1. What happens internal to a company is not a matter of public knowledge. An outsider can only presume the intentions of a company, but not know the information he/she is not privy to.

2. If not for the doctrine, the company could escape creditors by denying the authority of officials to act on its behalf.

(2*1 = 2 MARKS)

Exceptions to Doctrine of Indoor Management (Applicability of doctrine of constructive notice)

1. **Knowledge of irregularity** : In case this 'outsider' has actual knowledge of irregularity within the company, the benefit under the rule of indoor management would no longer be available. In fact, he/she may well be considered part of the irregularity.
2. **Negligence** : If, with a minimum of effort, the irregularities within a company could be discovered, the benefit of the rule of indoor management would not apply. The protection of the rule is also not available where the circumstances company does not make proper inquiry.
3. **Forgery** : The rule does not apply where a person relies upon a document that turns out to be forged since nothing can validate forgery. A company can never be held bound for forgeries committed by its officers.

(3*1 = 3 MARKS)

ANSWER-D

A Proxy is an **instrument in writing executed by a shareholder authorizing another person to attend a meeting and to vote thereat on his behalf and in his absence.** As per the provisions of Section 105 of the Companies Act, 2013, every shareholder who is entitled to attend and vote has a statutory right to appoint another person as his proxy. It is not necessary that the proxy be a member of the company. Further, any provision in the articles of association of the company requiring instrument of proxy to be lodged with the company more than 48 hours before a meeting shall have effect as if 48 hours had been specified therein. The members have a right to revoke the proxy's authority by voting himself before the proxy has voted but once the proxy has voted the member cannot retract his authority.

Where two proxy instruments by the same shareholder are lodged in respect of the same votes before the expiry of the time for lodging, there the proxies, the second in time will be counted and where one is lodged before and the other after the expiry of the date fixed for lodging proxies, the former will be counted. Thus, in case of Member X, the proxy Z (and not Proxy Y) will be permitted to vote on his behalf. However, in the case of Member W, the proxy M (and not Proxy N) will be permitted to vote as the proxy authorizing N to vote was deposited in less than 48 hours before the meeting.

(5 MARKS)